

## **Memorandum**

From: Astrid Scholz, Ecotrust

To: Marine Life Protection Act Initiative

26 November 2007

### **Notes regarding an error in the November 17, 2007 draft of Ecotrust's "Summary of potential impacts of the October 2007 MPA proposals on commercial fisheries in the North Central Coast Study Region"**

It was brought to our attention by members of the North Central Coast Regional Stakeholder Group that there were some possible errors in the "Summary of potential impacts of the October 2007 MPA proposals on commercial fisheries in the North Central Coast Study Region" that was presented to the SAT on the 13<sup>th</sup> of November and BRTF on the 19<sup>th</sup> of November. Specifically, the results presented in Table 9 and Appendix A for the ports of Bodega, Bolinas, San Francisco, and Half Moon Bay were identical for the Emerald A and External C proposals.

Taking this information, Ecotrust staff retraced their steps and identified a mistake had been made when copying and pasting information from one file to another for the analysis of the External C proposal. Results shown for the Emerald A proposal were correct and, as such, do not change. Corrections were made to the External C proposal calculations and the correct results for *only* the External C proposal (both Table 9 and Appendix A) are presented in this memo. These results also are reflected in an updated version of Ecotrust's "Summary of potential impacts of the October 2007 MPA proposals on commercial fisheries in the North Central Coast Study Region" dated November 26, 2007.

Additionally, after further inspection by Ecotrust staff another discrepancy was also identified in Table 10, where the results for proposal Emerald A were switched with Turquoise A and Emerald B with Turquoise B. Corrected results are reflected in the updated version of Ecotrust's "Summary of potential impacts of the October 2007 MPA proposals on commercial fisheries in the North Central Coast Study Region" dated November 26, 2007, but not in this memo.

Updated Table 9 results for External C, comparing the figures reported in the November 17<sup>th</sup> and 26<sup>th</sup> documents

		17-Nov-07	26-Nov-07
Fisheries		C	C
Point Arena	California Halibut	--	--
	Coastal Pelagics	--	--
	Market Squid	--	--
	Rockfish - Deeper Nearshore	55.5%	55.5%
	Rockfish - Nearshore	45.7%	45.7%
	Urchin	13.7%	13.7%
	Dungeness Crab	13.2%	13.2%
	Salmon	19.1%	19.1%
Bodega Bay	California Halibut	6.5%	12.6%
	Coastal Pelagics	--	--
	Market Squid	--	--
	Rockfish - Deeper Nearshore	26.0%	43.7%
	Rockfish - Nearshore	25.1%	23.2%
	Urchin	37.3%	35.0%
	Dungeness Crab	4.7%	13.9%
	Salmon	2.8%	12.7%
Bolinas	California Halibut	9.4%	14.4%
	Coastal Pelagics	--	--
	Market Squid	--	--
	Rockfish - Deeper Nearshore	68.6%	85.7%
	Rockfish - Nearshore	--	--
	Urchin	--	--
	Dungeness Crab	0.0%	9.4%
	Salmon	2.9%	18.9%
San Francisco	California Halibut	0.5%	0.6%
	Coastal Pelagics	--	--
	Market Squid	--	--
	Rockfish - Deeper Nearshore	31.7%	40.3%
	Rockfish - Nearshore	11.4%	18.1%
	Urchin	34.9%	29.9%
	Dungeness Crab	1.9%	6.0%
	Salmon	1.9%	7.1%
Half Moon Bay	California Halibut	0.6%	0.8%
	Coastal Pelagics	0.9%	0.9%
	Market Squid	23.0%	26.5%
	Rockfish - Deeper Nearshore	13.1%	20.0%
	Rockfish - Nearshore	1.9%	48.7%
	Urchin	--	--
	Dungeness Crab	1.3%	4.9%
	Salmon	1.9%	9.4%

Updated Appendix A results for External C, comparing the figures reported in the November 17<sup>th</sup> and 26<sup>th</sup> documents

**I. POINT ARENA**

<b>Fishery</b>	<b>Impact</b>	<b>17-Nov-07</b>	<b>26-Nov-07</b>
Ca. Halibut	\$ NEI	—	—
Coastal Pelagics	\$ NEI	—	—
Market Squid	\$ NEI	—	—
D. N. Rockfish	\$ NEI	\$3,901	\$3,901
N. Rockfish	\$ NEI	\$147,391	\$147,391
Urchin	\$ NEI	\$426,062	\$426,062
Dungeness Crab	\$ NEI	\$29,976	\$29,976
Salmon	\$ NEI	\$76,455	\$76,455
<b>All Fisheries</b>	<b>\$ NEI</b>	<b>\$683,784</b>	<b>\$683,784</b>

<b>Fishery</b>	<b>Impact</b>		
Ca. Halibut	% NEI	—	—
Coastal Pelagics	% NEI	—	—
Market Squid	% NEI	—	—
D. N. Rockfish	% NEI	87.5%	87.5%
N. Rockfish	% NEI	72.0%	72.0%
Urchin	% NEI	18.6%	18.6%
Dungeness Crab	% NEI	19.1%	19.1%
Salmon	% NEI	28.0%	28.0%
<b>All Fisheries</b>	<b>% NEI</b>	<b>23.3%</b>	<b>23.3%</b>

**II. BODEGA BAY**

<b>Fishery</b>	<b>Impact</b>	<b>17-Nov-07</b>	<b>26-Nov-07</b>
Ca. Halibut	\$ NEI	\$6,658	\$12,925
Coastal Pelagics	\$ NEI	—	—
Market Squid	\$ NEI	—	—
D. N. Rockfish	\$ NEI	\$31,610	\$53,125
N. Rockfish	\$ NEI	\$50,792	\$47,041
Urchin	\$ NEI	\$463,068	\$434,266
Dungeness Crab	\$ NEI	\$530,011	\$1,576,443
Salmon	\$ NEI	\$285,129	\$1,289,674
<b>All Fisheries</b>	<b>\$ NEI</b>	<b>\$1,367,267</b>	<b>\$3,413,473</b>

<b>Fishery</b>	<b>Impact</b>		
Ca. Halibut	% NEI	9.7%	18.7%
Coastal Pelagics	% NEI	—	—
Market Squid	% NEI	—	—
D. N. Rockfish	% NEI	41.0%	68.9%
N. Rockfish	% NEI	39.5%	36.6%
Urchin	% NEI	50.6%	47.4%
Dungeness Crab	% NEI	6.8%	20.2%
Salmon	% NEI	4.1%	18.6%
<b>All Fisheries</b>	<b>% NEI</b>	<b>8.6%</b>	<b>21.5%</b>

### III. BOLINAS

<u>Fishery</u>	<u>Impact</u>	<u>17-Nov-07</u>	<u>26-Nov-07</u>
Ca. Halibut	\$ NEI	\$11,267	\$17,223
Coastal Pelagics	\$ NEI	—	—
Market Squid	\$ NEI	—	—
D. N. Rockfish	\$ NEI	\$7,735	\$9,662
N. Rockfish	\$ NEI	—	—
Urchin	\$ NEI	—	—
Dungeness Crab	\$ NEI	\$0	\$50,074
Salmon	\$ NEI	\$2,525	\$16,247
<b>All Fisheries</b>	<b>\$ NEI</b>	<b>\$21,526</b>	<b>\$93,205</b>

<u>Fishery</u>	<u>Impact</u>		
Ca. Halibut	% NEI	14.1%	21.5%
Coastal Pelagics	% NEI	—	—
Market Squid	% NEI	—	—
D. N. Rockfish	% NEI	108.1%	135.1%
N. Rockfish	% NEI	—	—
Urchin	% NEI	—	—
Dungeness Crab	% NEI	0.0%	13.6%
Salmon	% NEI	4.3%	27.8%
<b>All Fisheries</b>	<b>% NEI</b>	<b>4.2%</b>	<b>18.1%</b>

### IV. SAN FRANCISCO

<u>Fishery</u>	<u>Impact</u>	<u>17-Nov-07</u>	<u>26-Nov-07</u>
Ca. Halibut	\$ NEI	\$5,401	\$5,930
Coastal Pelagics	\$ NEI	—	—
Market Squid	\$ NEI	—	—
D. N. Rockfish	\$ NEI	\$90,966	\$115,914
N. Rockfish	\$ NEI	\$25,177	\$40,089
Urchin	\$ NEI	\$16,065	\$13,768
Dungeness Crab	\$ NEI	\$342,186	\$1,054,778
Salmon	\$ NEI	\$202,680	\$761,389
<b>All Fisheries</b>	<b>\$ NEI</b>	<b>\$682,474</b>	<b>\$1,991,869</b>

<u>Fishery</u>	<u>Impact</u>		
Ca. Halibut	% NEI	0.8%	0.8%
Coastal Pelagics	% NEI	—	—
Market Squid	% NEI	—	—
D. N. Rockfish	% NEI	49.9%	63.6%
N. Rockfish	% NEI	17.9%	28.6%
Urchin	% NEI	47.3%	40.6%
Dungeness Crab	% NEI	2.8%	8.7%
Salmon	% NEI	2.8%	10.4%
<b>All Fisheries</b>	<b>% NEI</b>	<b>3.3%</b>	<b>9.7%</b>

**V. HALF MOON BAY**

<b>Fishery</b>	<b>Impact</b>	<b>17-Nov-07</b>	<b>26-Nov-07</b>
Ca. Halibut	\$ NEI	\$1,103	\$1,344
Coastal Pelagics	\$ NEI	\$420	\$440
Market Squid	\$ NEI	\$134,090	\$154,338
D. N. Rockfish	\$ NEI	\$13,259	\$20,248
N. Rockfish	\$ NEI	\$327	\$8,324
Urchin	\$ NEI	—	—
Dungeness Crab	\$ NEI	\$150,547	\$546,014
Salmon	\$ NEI	\$147,252	\$725,409
<b>All Fisheries</b>	<b>\$ NEI</b>	<b>\$446,997</b>	<b>\$1,456,117</b>

<b>Fishery</b>	<b>Impact</b>		
Ca. Halibut	% NEI	1.0%	1.2%
Coastal Pelagics	% NEI	1.0%	1.0%
Market Squid	% NEI	25.9%	29.8%
D. N. Rockfish	% NEI	20.6%	31.5%
N. Rockfish	% NEI	3.0%	76.8%
Urchin	% NEI	—	—
Dungeness Crab	% NEI	1.9%	7.1%
Salmon	% NEI	2.8%	13.7%
<b>All Fisheries</b>	<b>% NEI</b>	<b>3.2%</b>	<b>10.6%</b>

**VI. NORTH CENTRAL COAST STUDY REGION**

<b>Fishery</b>	<b>Impact</b>	<b>17-Nov-07</b>	<b>26-Nov-07</b>
Ca. Halibut	\$ NEI	\$24,428	\$37,422
Coastal Pelagics	\$ NEI	\$420	\$440
Market Squid	\$ NEI	\$134,090	\$154,338
D. N. Rockfish	\$ NEI	\$147,470	\$202,849
N. Rockfish	\$ NEI	\$223,687	\$242,845
Urchin	\$ NEI	\$905,194	\$874,096
Dungeness Crab	\$ NEI	\$1,052,720	\$3,257,285
Salmon	\$ NEI	\$714,040	\$2,869,175
<b>All Fisheries</b>	<b>\$ NEI</b>	<b>\$3,202,050</b>	<b>\$7,638,449</b>

<b>Fishery</b>	<b>Impact</b>		
Ca. Halibut	% NEI	2.5%	3.8%
Coastal Pelagics	% NEI	0.6%	0.6%
Market Squid	% NEI	17.4%	20.0%
D. N. Rockfish	% NEI	44.0%	60.5%
N. Rockfish	% NEI	46.2%	50.1%
Urchin	% NEI	27.8%	26.8%
Dungeness Crab	% NEI	3.7%	11.6%
Salmon	% NEI	3.6%	14.5%
<b>All Fisheries</b>	<b>% NEI</b>	<b>5.9%</b>	<b>14.2%</b>