

Lessons Learned for the MLPA North Central Coast Study Region

Report to the MLPA Blue Ribbon Task Force
September 8, 2008

Presented by: J. Michael Harty, Harty Conflict
Consulting & Mediation

Overview of NCC Lessons Learned Process

Introduction:

- Context for presentation different:
transition to South Coast
- Report delivery end of September
- Anticipate findings and recommendations
will appear in substantially the same form
- Memorandum for Initiative staff to support
RSG candidate interviews in July 2008

Overview of NCC Lessons Learned Process

Lessons Learned Evaluation Approach:

- Observation of NCC process: BRTF, SAT, and RSG meetings
- Interaction with Initiative staff, RSG members, and BRTF
- Interviews with BRTF, DFG, SAT, and I Team
- Online survey of RSG members and alternates in June

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

3

Overview of NCC Lessons Learned Process

Online RSG Survey and Report: Approach

- Conducted by Dr. Jonathan Raab, Raab Associates, Ltd/MIT, over 17 days in June following BRTF transmittal to Commission
- 32 responses out of 45 possible: [71%]
- Numerical scoring and written responses
- Written report and survey results submitted to Executive Director
- Raab report and survey results will be included in Lessons Learned

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

4

Overview of NCC Lessons Learned Process

Online RSG Survey and Report: Overview

- Higher overall satisfaction with process prior to Commission decision compared with CC: 3.90 vs. 3.00 [Q41]
 - Scale: 1 (very unsatisfied) to 6 (very satisfied) with mid-point of 3.5
- Even higher satisfaction prior to BRTF deliberations: 4.03 [Q23]
- Higher satisfaction with RSG balance and size
- Generally higher satisfaction for I Team, SAT, Facilitation Team, and DFG
- Planning/GIS staff highest “helpfulness” score: 5.52

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

5

Overview of NCC Lessons Learned Process

<i>Work Products</i>	<i>Mean “Helpfulness” Score</i>	<i>Comparison</i>
• Ground Rules	4.16	4.50
• Regional Profile	4.13	3.88
• Regional Goals	4.09	3.79
• Regional Objectives/ Design Considerations	3.88	3.54
• Round 1: Work Team Concepts and Draft External Proposals	4.13	NA
• Round 2: Draft Proposals	4.34	NA
• Round 3: NCCRSR Proposals	4.25	NA
• Options for Special Closures	3.13	NA

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

6

Overview of NCC Lessons Learned Process

Online RSG Survey and Report: BRTF

- Satisfaction with decision to forward 3 RSG alternatives: 4.35 [Q36]
- Helpfulness of BRTF guidance after Rounds 1 and 2: 3.55 [Q24]
- Satisfaction with substance of IPA: 3.48 [Q34]
- Satisfaction with April 22-23 deliberative process: 3.26 [Q32]

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

7

Overview of NCC Lessons Learned Process

Online RSG Survey and Report: BRTF

- Some confusion about NCC objective: consensus or multiple alternatives; less than for CC
- Sample comment: "A mixed message was given in that people were told that multiple proposals were expected but that a single proposal (if possible) would be accepted."
- Relative clarity about BRTF process for reviewing alternatives and making recommendation to Commission: 4.10 [Q37]

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

8

Overview of NCC Lessons Learned Process

BRTF: Summary

- High quality public policy development in real time
- Charge to develop MPA alternatives fulfilled
- Mixed views about recommendations on coordination
- Positive relationship with FGC
- Better outcome than on Central Coast

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

9

Overview of NCC Lessons Learned Process

BRTF: Summary

- Trust and confidence
- High expectations, room to improve
- Grasp of key concepts
- Willingness to listen and learn
- Complex relationship with RSG
- Attention to policy issues

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

10

Overview of NCC Lessons Learned Process

SAT: "Helpfulness" rating

- Overall 4.03
- Interaction with RSG 3.81
- Science questions 3.84
- Briefings 4.33
- Evaluation of proposals 4.39

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

11

Overview of NCC Lessons Learned Process

SAT: Perspectives

- Generally positive views
- Significant additions to social capital
- Absence of external critiques
- Constructive approach to integration of different views
- Treatment of scientific uncertainty
- Approach to levels of protection
- RSG input

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

12

Overview of NCC Lessons Learned Process

DFG: Perspectives

- Adjustment to new role described in MOU
- Adjustment to MPA management obligations including Channel Islands and Central Coast
- Capacity building for long term
- Planning/GIS support highest score highest
- Technical information and analysis: 3.84 [Q13]
- Input to Initiative: content, timing, delivery

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

13

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

When done well, public participation improves the quality and legitimacy of a decision and builds the capacity of all involved to engage in the policy process. It can lead to better results in terms of environmental quality and other social objectives. It also can enhance trust and understanding among parties. Achieving those results depends on using practices that address difficulties that specific aspects of the context can present.

NRC Report on Public Participation in Environmental Assessment and Decision Making, August 2008

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

14

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Summary of Findings

Finding One: The North Central Coast study region process was a successful continuation of the MLPA Initiative planning process and its public-private partnership model

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

15

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Summary of Findings:

Finding One (continued)

- The three alternatives generated by the Regional Stakeholder Group reflect significant convergence
- The Integrated Preferred Alternative reflects a BRTF consensus based substantially on components of the three RSG alternatives

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

16

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Summary of Findings:

Finding One (continued)

- The overall satisfaction of the RSG with the process was significantly higher than for the Central Coast based on survey results discussed earlier
- June 4, 2008 letter to Commission from 20 RSG members encouraging approval of IPA without further changes

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

17

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Summary of Findings

Finding Two: The Initiative processes and the BRTF recommendations provided a sufficient foundation for decision making by the Commission on MPA alternatives for the NCC

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

18

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Summary of Findings

Finding Three: The key elements of the Initiative functioned effectively on the NCC and appeared to benefit from lessons learned from the Central Coast and a continued willingness to experiment

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

19

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Summary of Findings

Finding Four: There is no conclusive reason why the basic structure and approach of the Initiative cannot be replicated for future study regions, including the South Coast

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

20

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Recommendation 1

- The basic Initiative structure and approach are the best option for the South Coast study region
- The Initiative should keep sight of the strengths of the public-private partnership model: flexibility, adaptability, nimbleness, and resources
- Explicit, joint commitment by all Initiative veterans to look with “fresh eyes” and listen with “fresh ears”
- The process is a product

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

21

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Recommendation 2: Public-Private Partnership

- A new MOU to ensure adequate resources for future study regions should be executed
- California’s budget crisis highlights the challenges of relying on public financing
- Continued separation and clear boundaries

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

22

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Recommendation 4: Blue Ribbon Task Force

- A BRTF should continue to play a significant role in development of MPA alternatives for the FGC in the South Coast study region
- Continue successful coordination with FGC
- Continue to find opportunities to meet and confer informally consistent with appropriate transparency
- Consider adjustments to accommodate increased BRTF size

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

23

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Recommendation 4: Blue Ribbon Task Force

- Address BRTF role and anticipated process with RSG early, directly, and consistently
 - A hierarchical partnership model
- Engage directly with RSG during MPA development process
- Continue iterative approach to developing MPA alternatives

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

24

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Recommendation 4: Blue Ribbon Task Force (cont.)

- Potential policy issues:
 - Role of socioeconomic information
 - Water quality [SAT to address September 15]
 - Role of spatially explicit models in MPA planning
 - Integrating MPA planning with management
 - Funding
- Clarify objectives for “preparing information and recommendations for coordinating management of MPAs with federal agencies”
- Evaluate structural aspect of policy role: sub-groups?
- I Team integration

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

25

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Recommendation 4: Blue Ribbon Task Force (cont.)

- Anticipate higher public interest and desire to participate or comment at BRTF meetings
- Anticipate intensity of competing resource uses
- Consider process adaptations consistent with local government interest

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

26

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Recommendation 5: Initiative Staff

- Retain current Executive Director and key staff
- Continue to hire professional staff and consultants to fill specific needs using contracting mechanisms and funding available through public-private model
- Ensure staffing matches changing needs including supervision, management, and policy
- Continue to emphasize project focus, adaptability, quality, partnership, and commitment

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

27

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Recommendation 6: Department of Fish and Game

- Ensure a consistent, authoritative policy voice in communications with BRTF and interactions with RSG
- Identify feasibility issues early in RSG process to allow time for adjustment
- Continue building internal capacity to support MPA planning
- Maintain commitment to strengths like GIS
- Work with other Initiative elements to integrate MPA planning with management including Regional Goals and Objectives
- Identify opportunities

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

28

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Recommendation 7: Science Advisory Team

“Scientists are usually in the best position to identify and systematically consider the effects of environmental processes and actions. However, good scientific analysis often requires information about local context that is most likely to come from people with close experience with local conditions.” NRC Report at 6.2.

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

29

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Recommendation 7: Science Advisory Team

- MPA science is evolving
- Data gaps, complexity, and uncertainty are part of best readily available scientific information
- SAT role includes explaining uncertainty and integrating public knowledge in public view

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

30

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Recommendation 7: Science Advisory Team

- Maintain rigorous and pragmatic focus on science consistent with SAT charter
- Refine approach to data gaps, complexity, and uncertainty and effectively communicate this to BRTF, RSG, and public

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

31

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Recommendation 7: Science Advisory Team

- Educate RSG about science guidelines and evaluation methodology early
- Be explicit about potential modifications to science guidelines and evaluation criteria based on anticipated science issues for the South Coast, e.g., influence of ocean currents
- Consult with BRTF regarding role of spatially explicit models in MPA planning early in South Coast study region
- Refine science of water quality in MPA design and develop recommendations for BRTF

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

32

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Recommendation 7: Science Advisory Team

- Work with IT to reduce time required to respond to RSG questions
 - Survey score for helpfulness: 3.84
- Design meetings and agendas to allow sufficient time for discussion of science issues
- Refine approach to user knowledge
 - Survey score for helpfulness of direct interaction: 3.81
- Consider alternatives to voting
- Retain co-chairs approach

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

33

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Recommendation 8: FGC Coordination

- The BRTF and FGC should maintain emphasis on coordination and effective integration of the MOU's advisory decision making process
- I Team and Commission liaison roles

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

34

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Recommendation 8: Policy Issues

The FGC and BRTF should coordinate on approaches to policy issues:

- Role of socioeconomic information for the South Coast
- Role of spatially explicit models developed by the SAT in MPA network design
- Integration of MPA design with MPA management including monitoring
- Role of water quality in MPA network design
- Funding for MLPA implementation

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

35

Summary of Anticipated Findings and Recommendations

Recommendation 9: Public Understanding

The FGC, BRTF, and DFG should collaborate to improve public understanding of and access to the Initiative:

- Web site accessibility
- Visual depictions of MLPA implementation activities, such as a timeline that identifies key process steps, where the process is at any point in time, and options for public involvement

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

36

END

September 8, 2008

Harty Conflict Consulting &
Mediation

37